

1 THE POWER GAME

Introduction	19
<i>The Importance of Electricity</i>	19
<i>Historical Supply Approaches</i>	19
<i>Winds of Change</i>	20
<i>Purpose of this Book</i>	20
<i>Analytical Criteria</i>	21
Lead Actors in a Model Electricity System	21
“Power” in the Electricity Sector	22
<i>More than just Physics</i>	22
<i>Role of Technology</i>	22
<i>Some Other Types of Power</i>	24
<i>Importance of the Ability to Set Electricity Prices</i>	24
<i>Influence of Electricity Prices on Consumer Conservation and Efficiencies</i>	25
<i>Shifting Power amongst State Sector Electricity Actors</i>	26
<i>Control of the Wholesale Electricity Market</i>	26
<i>Consumer Choice</i>	26
<i>Market Power in Transmission and Distribution</i>	27
<i>Industry Governance and Development</i>	27
A Look Ahead	28

2 ELECTRICITY AND ELECTRICITY MARKETS

Introduction	31
What is so Special about Electricity?	31
<i>In General</i>	31
<i>In New Zealand</i>	34
<i>Price-Inelastic Electricity Demand</i>	35
<i>Short Run versus Long Run</i>	37
<i>Decreasing Price Elasticity of Electricity Supply</i>	38
<i>Centralised Electricity Markets</i>	38
<i>Decentralised Electricity Markets</i>	40
<i>Comparing Electricity Market Types</i>	41
Electricity Markets – How They Work	42
<i>Engineering Meets Economics</i>	42
<i>Electricity Market Architecture</i>	42

<i>System Operator and Ancillary Services</i>	42
<i>Wholesale Markets, Market Operation, Scheduling, Dispatch, and Balancing</i>	43
<i>Wholesale Market Types</i>	43
<i>Hedging</i>	44
<i>Zonal versus Nodal Pricing – Losses and Congestion</i>	44
<i>Linkages to Other Markets</i>	45
<i>Comparing the NZEM with Other Electricity Markets</i>	49
Electricity Markets – Do They Work?	50
Conclusion	54
APPENDIX 2.1 – A BRIEF TAXONOMY OF MARKET TYPES	56
Introduction	56
Bilateral Markets	56
Mediated Markets	57
Exchange or Auction Markets	57
Electricity Pools	58
APPENDIX 2.2 – DECENTRALISED DECISION-MAKING AND THE NZEM	59
Information and Accountability	59
Coordination under Decentralisation	59
Rationale for Decentralisation versus Centralised Control	61

3 THE NEW ZEALAND ELECTRICITY SYSTEM

Introduction	63
National Energy Sources and Uses	63
Structure of the Contemporary Electricity Sector	66
Generation	67
<i>Reconfiguration and Ownership</i>	67
<i>Location</i>	68
<i>Composition</i>	69
Spot Wholesale Electricity Market	72
<i>Structure</i>	72
<i>Services and Operation</i>	73
<i>Pricing and Performance</i>	74
Transmission	77

Distribution	85
<i>Composition and Ownership</i>	85
<i>Financial Performance</i>	86
<i>Operational Characteristics and Performance</i>	89
<i>Lines Quality</i>	91
Energy Retailing	93
Consumption	96
Financial Returns	99
<i>Returns to Government and the Taxpayer</i>	99
<i>Financial Performance</i>	101
Conclusion	106
APPENDIX 3.1 – PERFORMANCE OF THE NATIONAL GRID 1990-2003	107
Introduction	107
Energy Transport	108
Reliability and Security	111
Interconnection	112
APPENDIX 3.2 – NOTES AND SOURCES FOR FIGURES 3.34-3.37	114
General Approach	114
Data Sources	115

Introduction	117
<i>Broad Reform Trends</i>	117
<i>Deregulation, Liberalisation or “Reregulation”?</i>	117
<i>Rise of “the Market”</i>	118
Contemporary Electricity Reforms around the World	118
England and Wales	119
<i>Wider Reform Agenda</i>	119
<i>Reform Background</i>	119
<i>Generation and Transmission</i>	120
<i>Distribution/Retailing and Regulation</i>	120
<i>Re-Reform</i>	120
United States	121
<i>Anti-competitive Regulation Origins</i>	121
<i>Dominance of Investor-Owned Utilities</i>	122

<i>Reform Imperatives</i>	122
<i>California</i>	124
Australia	126
<i>Partially Converging State Reforms</i>	126
<i>Reform Background</i>	126
<i>Reform Motivation</i>	126
<i>National Electricity Market (NEM)</i>	127
<i>Reform Progress</i>	127
<i>Victoria</i>	128
<i>Rapid Change</i>	128
European Union	129
<i>Background</i>	129
<i>EU Reform Directive</i>	129
<i>Further Reform</i>	131

5 NEW ZEALAND'S ELECTRICITY REFORM HISTORY

Introduction	134
<i>International Context</i>	134
<i>Domestic Context</i>	134
<i>Existing Arrangements Unsatisfactory</i>	134
Historical Backdrop	135
The Reforming 1980s	137
<i>Reforming Government</i>	137
<i>From Government Department to Corporation</i>	137
<i>Early Policy and Reform Objectives</i>	138
Ownership, Structure & Regulation – The 1989 Electricity Task Force	139
Responses to the Task Force Report	139
<i>ECNZ Break-up Examined</i>	139
<i>Separation of Generation and Transmission – Trans Power Establishment Board</i>	141
<i>Wholesale Market Development</i>	142
Wholesale Electricity Market Study (WEMS)	143
Wholesale Electricity Market Development Group (WEMDG)	144
EIC, M-Co, NZEM, MARIA, and the June 1995 Reforms	144
Break-up of Generation	147
<i>Tying ECNZ's Hands</i>	147
<i>June 1995 Memorandum of Understanding</i>	147

<i>ECNZ's Final Separation, and the Birth of Vertically Integrated "Gentailers"</i>	148
<i>Wholesale Market Prices versus ECNZ Predictions</i>	149
Distribution Reform and Re-Reform	150
<i>Anticipatory Reforms</i>	150
<i>Electricity Act 1992 and Energy Companies Act 1992</i>	151
<i>"A Better Deal for Electricity Consumers"</i>	152
<i>Deemed Profiling and Customer Switching</i>	152
<i>Retail Margins and Competition</i>	153
Regulation and Re-Regulation	154
<i>Birth of Light-Handed Regulation</i>	154
<i>ODV Rules</i>	156
<i>June 2000 Electricity Industry Inquiry</i>	157
<i>Shift to Heavy Regulation</i>	157
"A Fair Deal for Electricity Consumers"	157
Current Agendas	158
<i>Rapid Industry Centralisation – The Electricity Commission</i>	158
<i>Distributed Generation Encouraged</i>	161
<i>Rapidly Expanding Regulatory Powers</i>	162
Conclusion	162
APPENDIX 5.1 – WHOLESALE PRICES UNDER STRUCTURAL CHANGE	164

6

COPING WITH CRISES

Electricity Systems Vulnerable to Shocks and Crises	167
<i>Overseas Events</i>	167
<i>Fuel Risks and the Weather</i>	168
<i>Changing Balance of Supply and Demand</i>	168
<i>Systemic Risks</i>	169
New Zealand's Vulnerabilities and Responses – Before Contemporary Reforms	169
<i>Early Twentieth Century</i>	169
<i>1940s and 1950s</i>	169
<i>1960s and 1970s</i>	170
<i>1980s</i>	170
New Zealand's "Crises" and Responses – After Contemporary Reforms	170
<i>Earlier Lessons Forgotten</i>	170
<i>1992 Winter Crisis</i>	171
<i>Sea-Change in Response</i>	172
<i>Role of the Fledgling Wholesale Market</i>	172
<i>2001 Winter Crisis</i>	173

<i>Government Steps in on Behalf of Industry</i>	175
<i>Residential Customers Insulated but NGC Exposed</i>	175
<i>Reformed Arrangements Criticised</i>	176
<i>Reformed Arrangements Rise to Challenge</i>	176
<i>Voluntary Savings Displace Rationing</i>	177
<i>2003 Winter Power Scare</i>	178
<i>Wholesale Market gives Early Warning</i>	178
<i>Government Intervenes Despite Disappearing Crisis</i>	179
<i>1998 Auckland CBD Outage</i>	180
<i>2004 Loss of the HVDC Link</i>	180
<i>Reformed Arrangements Survive Major Challenge</i>	181
Discussion – Wholesale Electricity Price Rises: Cure or Disease?	181
<i>Lack of Customer Choice?</i>	182
<i>Larger Customers Bear Disproportionate Burden?</i>	183
<i>Inadequate Capacity?</i>	183
Reserve Generation Reconsidered	184
Conclusion	186

7 DEMAND-SIDE PARTICIPATION

Introduction	187
<i>An Increasing Focus</i>	187
<i>Economic Issues</i>	188
<i>Main Demand-Side Thrusts</i>	188
History of Demand-Side Participation	189
<i>Pre-Reforms</i>	189
<i>Industry Initiatives Post-Reform</i>	190
<i>Supply-Side Structural Stalemate or Equilibrium?</i>	191
<i>Hedge Market Regulation – Demand-Side Distortions</i>	192
<i>Co-Investments in Demand-Side Initiatives</i>	193
<i>Orion Energy – Decoupling Peak Demand from Demand Growth</i>	193
<i>Metering Advances</i>	194
<i>Power Exchanges</i>	195
<i>Former NZEM Initiatives</i>	195
<i>Electricity Commission Takes Over</i>	196
Energy Efficiency and Conservation Authority (EECA)	196
<i>Some Obstacles</i>	197
<i>Fonterra and NZAS Initiatives</i>	199
<i>Firm and Day-Ahead Prices</i>	199

Whom to Target?	200
<i>A Stocktake</i>	203
The Ultimate Goal?	203
Conclusion	205

Introduction	207
Centralisation and Decentralisation in the New Zealand Electricity Sector	208
<i>Recent International Context</i>	208
<i>Early Decentralisation Short Lived</i>	209
<i>Market Solutions Supplanted by Government</i>	209
<i>Origins of the Wholesale Electricity Market</i>	214
<i>An Unintended Consequence?</i>	215
The Role of Governance	216
<i>What is Governance?</i>	216
<i>When Governance is Relevant</i>	216
<i>Governance and Competition Laws</i>	217
<i>Early Governance in the Reformed Electricity Sector</i>	217
<i>New Electricity Commission</i>	218
<i>Governance Role Expanded to Management</i>	219
<i>Minister Has Effective Control</i>	219
<i>Price Controls Also Imposed</i>	221
<i>Conflicting Roles</i>	222
<i>Electricity and Gas Industries Bill 2003</i>	222
<i>Goal Posts Shifted</i>	223
Transmission Insecurity – What’s at Fault?	225
Conclusion	230
APPENDIX 8.1 – INDUSTRY EVOLUTION, MARKETS, POLITICS, AND DE/CENTRALISATION	232
Introduction	232
Influences Affecting Industry Evolution	232
Industries, Markets and Politics	233
Decentralised and Centralised Control	235

Introduction	239
Gaming	239
<i>Pernicious Overtones</i>	240
<i>Lessons from England and Wales</i>	241
<i>Problems with Uniform Price Auctions</i>	241
<i>Calls for Pay-as-Bid Auctions</i>	243
<i>Changing Issues</i>	244
<i>Gaming of a Higher Order</i>	245
Market Power	245
<i>Horizontal and Vertical Variants</i>	245
<i>Market Power in Generation</i>	246
<i>Market Arrangements to Mitigate Market Power</i>	247
<i>Vertical Integration and Hedging</i>	247
<i>Spot Market "Thinness"</i>	248
<i>Forced Hedging and De-Integration</i>	248
<i>Importance of Transmission Constraints</i>	249
<i>Is Market Power all Bad? – Static versus Dynamic Efficiency</i>	251
<i>Market Power in Transmission</i>	252
<i>Incentives for Efficient Grid Investment</i>	253
<i>Market Power in Distribution</i>	256
<i>Market Power in Retailing?</i>	256
<i>Testing for Market Power</i>	257
Regulation	261
<i>Nature and Motivation</i>	261
<i>Purpose</i>	262
<i>Some Theories of Regulation</i>	263
<i>Regulatory Approaches</i>	264
Ownership Reform – The Neglected Regulatory Component?	265
<i>State Ownership as a Defence against Market Power</i>	265
<i>Profit Motive Aids Regulation</i>	265
<i>Ownership Reforms to Date</i>	266
<i>Community or Consumer Ownership of Distribution</i>	267
<i>Ownership of Transpower can be Bettered</i>	268
<i>US Models of Grid Ownership</i>	268
<i>England and Wales Model of Grid Ownership</i>	269
<i>Other Grid Ownership Models</i>	270
<i>"Club" Ownership of Transpower Shelved Despite Promise</i>	270
<i>Models Compared</i>	271

Some Reflections on the New Zealand Electricity Reforms	271
<i>Market Power and Gaming neither Universal nor Damning</i>	271
<i>Privatisation Feasible but Unpalatable</i>	272
<i>Transmission Issues Remain</i>	272
<i>Limitations of ODV Regulation</i>	273
<i>Over-Regulation of Distribution</i>	274
<i>Distribution Regulation in Context</i>	274
APPENDIX 9.1 – COMPARING REGULATORY ALTERNATIVES	276
Types of Regulation	276
<i>Rate-of-Return Regulation</i>	276
<i>Incentive Regulation</i>	276
<i>Approaches Compared</i>	278
<i>Hybrid Models</i>	279
Common Regulatory Problems	279
<i>Cross-Subsidy</i>	279
<i>Service Obligations</i>	280
<i>Degeneration to de facto Government Control</i>	280
<i>Redefining the “Game”</i>	281

Introduction	283
<i>An Important Crossroad</i>	283
<i>The Grid is the Nub</i>	284
What New Investment Is Actually “Needed”?	285
Issues Confronting New Generation Investment	286
<i>Gas Supply</i>	288
<i>Kyoto Policy</i>	289
<i>Project Aqua and Competition for Water Rights</i>	290
<i>Other Investment Issues</i>	291
Supply Security in Electricity Markets	292
<i>Dry-Winter Episodes Continue</i>	292
<i>Market Reforms Failing to Provide Security?</i>	293
<i>Reserve Generation</i>	294
<i>“Public Goods” and “Market Failure”</i>	294
<i>Capacity Mechanisms and Alternatives Supporting Supply Security</i>	295
Grid Investment	297
<i>Transpower’s Changing Investment Incentives</i>	297

<i>Non-Transpower/Merchant Grid Investment</i>	297
<i>Changing Centralisation of Grid Investment</i>	299
<i>Alternative Strategy to Simplify Grid Investment</i>	299
<i>Contrast with Demand Management and Distributed Generation</i>	301
<i>Using Ownership to Support Grid Investment</i>	301
<i>Customer Ownership to Internalise Investment Incentives and Coordination</i>	302
<i>Regulated Investor Ownership</i>	303
Breaking the Impasse between Grid and Generation Investment	304
<i>The Strategic Problem</i>	304
<i>Regulated Investor Ownership as a Solution</i>	304
<i>The “Club” Model as a Solution</i>	305
Conclusion	305

11	WHITHER NEW ZEALAND’S REFORMS?
-----------	---------------------------------------

Centralised but Private Origins	309
Decentralisation and Privatisation Highlighting Governance	309
New Zealand Re-Centralising with Ongoing State Ownership	310
Supply Security a Focus	310
Decentralisation Provides Options	311
Demand-Side Responsiveness – Helpful, but Desired?	311
Gaming Incentives	312
Responses to Gaming and Market Power	313
Preserving Investment Incentives	314
Electricity Commission Changes Industry Focus	315
New Zealand’s Reforms Successful to a Point	315
More Recent Reforms Cast a Shadow	316